



DOUGLAS A. DUCEY  
- GOVERNOR -

VICTORIA WHITMORE  
- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -

## ARIZONA STATE VETERINARY MEDICAL EXAMINING BOARD

9535 E. DOUBLETREE RANCH RD., STE. 100 • SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85258

PHONE: (602) 364-1-PET • FAX: (602) 364-1039

VETBOARD.AZ.GOV

### MINUTES

October 21, 2015

Board Room, at 8:30 a.m.

9535 E. Doubletree Ranch Rd.  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85258

**Members Present:** Dr. Darren Wright, Mr. James Loughead, Ms. Julie Mumford C.V.T., Ms. Jessica Amend, and Ms. Julie Young.

**Members Absent:** Dr. Christina Bertch-Mumaw, Dr. Les Hatfield, Dr. Brian Serbin and Dr. J. Gregory Byrne.

**Staff and Legal Counsel Present:** Ms. Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director (E.D.); Mr. Marc Harris, Assistant Attorney General (A.A.G.), and Ms. Tracy Riendeau, C.V.T., Investigations.

### I. CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Julie Mumford, Secretary, at 8:33 a.m.

**Roll call:** Ms. Victoria Whitmore.

### II. INITIAL INVESTIGATIVE REVIEW

#### 1. 15-98, In Re: Emily Marcus, D.V.M.

Dr. Marcus was present with attorney David Stoll and made statements. Dr. Trond Hegle was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Ms. Young to schedule this matter for an **Informal Interview**. Motion passed unanimously.

#### 2. 15-100, In Re: ShanAnne Edwards, D.V.M.

Attorney David Stoll was present and made statements on behalf of Dr. Edwards. Ms. Tammy Longhurst was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Young and seconded by Dr. Wright to schedule this matter for an **Informal Interview**. Motion passed unanimously.

**3. 15-101, In Re: Holly Rice, D.V.M.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Mr. Loughead to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and dismiss this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

**4. 15-102, In Re: Lauren Ciminello, D.V.M.**

Dr. Ciminello was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Mr. Loughead to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and dismiss this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

**5. 15-103, In Re: Refaat Ishak, D.V.M.**

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Ms. Mumford to schedule this matter for an **Informal Interview**. Motion passed unanimously.

**6. 16-04, In Re: Ronald Sigler, D.V.M.**

Attorney David Stoll was present and made statements of behalf of Dr. Sigler. Mr. Richard Rendon was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Ms. Amend to dismiss this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

**7. 16-13, In Re: Kristina Ingram, D.V.M.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Mr. Loughead to offer Dr. Ingram a **Consent Agreement** accepting the proposed Findings of Fact as drafted and finding Dr. Ingram in violation of:

- A.R.S. § 32-2232 (13) fraud or misrepresentation in procuring a license; and
- A.R.S. § 32-2232 (14) knowingly signing a false affidavit.

Roll call: Mr. Loughead, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Ms. Mumford, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; and Ms. Young, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Amend for the Consent Agreement to include a civil penalty of **\$500** to be paid within 90 days of the effective date of the Consent Agreement. Roll call: Mr. Loughead, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Ms. Mumford, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; and Ms. Young, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

### **III. INFORMAL INTERVIEWS AND BOARD DELIBERATION**

**1. 15-78: In Re: Deborah Chapman, D.V.M. Continuance of Informal Interview of September 16, 2015, for the purpose of receiving additional information and reviewing and possible action to approve proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and adopting an Order.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Dr. Wright to accept the proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as drafted. Motion passed unanimously.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Dr. Wright to issue Dr. Chapman an Order to include a civil penalty of **\$500** to be paid within 90 days of the effective date of the Order. Roll call: Mr. Loughead, aye; Ms.

Amend, aye; Ms. Mumford, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; and Ms. Young, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **IV. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF PREVIOUS ACTIONS**

**1.14-27: In Re: Monica Bunge, D.V.M. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Board quarterly appearance required by consent agreement.**

Dr. Bunge was present telephonically, made statements and answered questions in compliance with her Consent Agreement.

**2. 11-99: In Re: Audie Wood, D.V.M. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Board annual appearance required by Board Order.**

Dr. Wood was present, made statements and answered questions in compliance of her Consent Agreement.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Young to give Ms. Whitmore the authority to order Dr. Wood to be retested if her lab results reveal any abnormalities. Motion passed unanimously.

**3. 15-35: In Re: Walter Kurth, D.V.M. Board may review, discuss, and take action on compliance with Board Order.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Mr. Loughead to open an investigation regarding Dr. Kurth's non-compliance of Board Order 15-35. Motion passed unanimously.

**4. 15-66: In Re: Wendy Schroeder-Hyde, D.V.M. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Dr. Schroeder-Hyde's response to Letter of Concern issued in case.**

No action taken.

**5. 15-69: In Re: Claudia Channing, D.V.M. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education plan submitted in compliance with Board Order.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Dr. Wright to accept Dr. Channing's continuing education plan in compliance with her Board Order. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **V. REPORTS, CORRESPONDENCE, REFERRALS AND OTHER BUSINESS**

**1. Board may review, discuss, and take action on information received regarding the Navajo Nation Veterinary Program.**

After discussion and consideration regarding allegations of unprofessional conduct related to the treatment of an animal and the ordering of controlled substances, the Board took no action with regards to the allegations related to the treatment of an animal. Part of the Board's discussion on this issue included the facts that the conduct occurred more than several years ago and that the animal resided on the Navajo reservation.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Dr. Wright to forward the concerns related to the ordering of controlled substance to the U.S. Drug Enforcement Agency (DEA). Motion passed unanimously.

**2. Board may review, discuss, and take action on information regarding American Association of Veterinary State Boards' 2015 annual meeting.**

Dr. Wright shared with the Board topics that were discussed at the annual AAVSB meeting.

**3. Board may review and discuss final Superior Court ruling in Case 14-05, Re: Refaat Ishak.**

Mr. Harris reported that the Board's action in the case had been upheld in Superior Court. No action taken.

**4. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Certified Veterinary Technician applications.**

**a. Lindi Arnold**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Dr. Wright to request Ms. Arnold appear before the Board at a future meeting. Motion passed unanimously.

**b. Hazel Elena**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Dr. Wright to allow Ms. Elena to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**c. Krystal Ramirez**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Young to allow Ms. Ramirez to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**d. Kristin Kemp**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Young to allow Ms. Kemp to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**e. Amy Ortiz (re-applying – Board previously approved to sit)**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Young to allow Ms. Ortiz to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**f. Maira Villa (re-applying – Board previously approved to sit)**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Dr. Wright to allow Ms. Villa to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**g. Rogerio De Souza (re-applying – Board previously approved to sit)**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Amend to allow Mr. De Souza to sit for the Certified Veterinary Technician exam. Motion passed unanimously.

**5. Board may review, discuss, and take action to rescind the motion to open a case regarding premise inspection of R2184, Desert Mountain Animal Hospital and discuss and take action regarding the premise inspection results.**

In order to ensure consistency in the handling of premise inspections, after discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Amend to rescind the Board's motion, made at its September 16, 2015, meeting, to open an investigation regarding the responsible veterinarian of premise R2184. The motion also included directing Board staff to follow up within the next year to ensure compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

**6. Board may review, discuss, and take action on reportable charges from Christopher Dorio, D.V.M.**

No action taken.

**7. Executive Director Report**

**a. Financial update**

Ms. Whitmore discussed the monthly performance measures and first quarter financial statement. Revenue and expenses are as expected.

**b. Upcoming meeting dates**

Ms. Whitmore reminded the Board that the November meeting will be held on a Thursday (November 19<sup>th</sup>) and stated that an in-person meeting would be needed in December.

**VI. CONSENT AGENDA**

**A. Approval to take State Veterinary Exam**

1. Kitchell, Barbara (S)
2. Gordon, Cynthia (E)
3. Jones, Cynthia (R)
4. Marion, Joshua (R)
5. Winslow, Christine (E)

**Approval to take the State Veterinary Exam granted.**

**B. Approval to take Certified Veterinary Technician Exam**

1. Audelo-Nunez, Tracee
2. Ahumada, Jennifer
3. Anderson, Amanda
4. Barros, Gina
5. Carlson, Amber
6. Child, Alexandra
7. Craig, Kristin
8. Craven, Jennifer
9. Croce, Sheri
10. DaSilva, Nirvana
11. De La Torre, Jessica
12. Driscoll-Bryant, Diane
13. Fenning, Katherine
14. Gray, Alicia
15. Harper, Anice
16. Harrington, Katherine

- 17.Hart, Heather
- 18.Healy-Johnson, Kelley
- 19.Herring, Brittany
- 20.Hunt, Marissa
- 21.Johnson, Debra
- 22.Kingston, Lauren
- 23.Martig, Katie
- 24.Martinez, Gianna
- 25.Olmos Hernandez, Maritza
- 26.Onello, Joseph
- 27.Reyes, Maria
- 28.Rodriguez, Emely
- 29.Smith, Amanda
- 30.Smith, Tracy
- 31.Spivey, Jennifer
- 32.Stockard, Cindy
- 33.Taylor, Chancey
- 34.Tobin, Hilary
- 35.Valencia, Vanesa
- 36.Varela, Crystal
- 37.Watson, Mallary
- 38.Weber, Chelsea
- 39.Wesoloski, Rebecca
- 40.Hoishan, Rachel

**Approval to take Certified Veterinary Technician Exam granted.**

**C. Approval of Certified Veterinary Technician Reinstatement**

1. Horton, Janelle
2. Lerma, Reynaldo
3. Jones, Denise

**Approval of Certified Veterinary Technician Reinstatement granted.**

**D. Approval of Veterinary License**

1. Alcott, Portia (E)
2. Foy, Daniel (E)
3. Laevey, Susan (E)
4. McKeever, Patrick (S)
5. Nieto, Armando (E)
6. Patil, Karuna (State Employee License)

**Approval of Veterinary License granted.**

**E. Approval of Temporary Permit(s)**

1. Kitchell, Barbara
2. Marion, Joshua
3. Jones, Cynthia (R)

**Approval of Temporary Permits granted.**

**F. Approval of Premise Licenses**

1. R2542: Copper Hills Veterinary Services, PLLC. New Premise. Rita Sanders, DVM.

2. R2543: Veterinary Acupuncture and Alternative Medicine, LLC. New Premise. Pamela Dragos, DVM.
3. R2545: Union Hills Animal Hospital. New Address. Susan Goshert, DVM.
4. R2546: Rebecca Johnson. New Premise. Rebecca Johnson, DVM.
5. R2547: Homeward Bound Spay Neuter Hospital. New Premise. Jill Askew, DVM.
6. R2548: Stetson Hills Animal Hospital. New Premise. Edward Cohen, DVM.
7. R2549: Desert Edge Equine Veterinary Services, PLLC. New Premise. Alana Hendrix, DVM.
8. R2551: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Holly Dougherty, DVM.
9. R2552: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Wayne Zuvers, DVM.
10. R2553: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Aaron Franko, DVM.
11. R2554: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Sandy Landry, DVM.
12. R2555: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Dino Herrera, DVM.
13. R2556: Home Fur Good. New Premise. Melvin Pence, DVM.
14. R2563: Pegasus Veterinary Center, PC. New Premise. Michael Hutchison, DVM.
15. R2564: Valet Vet Mobile Veterinary Services. New Address. Gina Lee Finney, DVM.
16. R2566: Dynamite Animal Hospital. New Owner. Carla Smith, DVM.
17. R2569: VIP Petcare-Tractor Supply Company- Fountain Hills. New Premise. Siobhan Jones, DVM.
18. R2570: Ironwood Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. H. Carter Metcalf, DVM.
19. R2571: 48 Hour MASH Clinic @ Los Ranchitos Elementary. New Premise. Karter Neal, DVM.  
**F (1), (4), (10), (12), (14), (17), and (18) removed from Consent Agenda.**  
**Approval of Premise Licenses granted.**

#### **G. Approval of Random Premise Inspections**

1. P0512: Coolidge Veterinary Hospital. Audie Wood, DVM.
2. R1090: Eastside Spay/Neuter Pet Clinic, Inc. Maria Curtis, DVM.
3. R1115: Foothills Animal Hospital. Kurt Baumler, DVM.
4. R1405: Eye Care for Animals – Gilbert. Paul Barrett, DVM.
5. R1527: Central Mesa Veterinary Hospital. Dawn Senter, DVM.

**Approval of Random Premise Inspections granted.**

#### **H. Approval of Premise Name Change Request**

1. R1962: North Valley Animal Clinic to North Valley Pet Hospital. William Dean, DVM.  
**Approval of Premise Name Change Request granted.**

#### **I. Approval of Premise Change of Scope Request**

1. R1405: Eye Care for Animals – Gilbert. Add Mobile Unit. Paul Barrett, DVM.
2. R1861: Animal Medical Center of Casa Grande. Add Mobile Unit. Kathryne Kasper, DVM.
3. R2510: MD PetCare. Add Mobile Unit. Rebecca Bukowy, DVM.
4. R1402: Eye Care for Animals – Tucson. Add Mobile Unit. Reuben Merideth, DVM.
5. R1403: Eye Care for Animals – Phoenix. Add Mobile Unit. Paul Barrett, DVM.
6. R1510: Eye Care for Animals – Avondale. Add Mobile Unit. Joanna Norman, DVM.
7. R2026: Eye Care for Animals – North Scottsdale. Add Mobile Unit. Paul Barrett, DVM.

**Approval of Premise Change of Scope Requests granted.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Ms. Amend to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion passed unanimously.

## Items Removed From Consent Agenda

F (1) R2532: Copper Hills Veterinary Services, PLLC. New Premise. Rita Sanders, DVM.

F (4): R2546: Rebecca Johnson. New Premise. Rebecca Johnson, DVM.

F (10): R2553: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Aaron Franko, DVM.

F (14): R2563: Pegasus Veterinary Center, PC. New Premise. Michael Hutchison, DVM.

F (17): R2569: VIP Petcare – Tractor Supply Company Fountain Hills. New Premise. Siobhan Jones, DVM.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Dr. Wright to approve the premise licenses pending compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

F (12): R2555: Emergency Animal Clinic. New Owner. Dino Herrera, DVM.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Ms. Young to approve the premise license pending inspection and compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

F (18): R2570: Ironwood Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. H. Carter Metcalf, DVM.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Mumford and seconded by Dr. Loughead to approve the premise license pending compliance. Board directs staff to do follow-up inspection within one year to ensure compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

## **VII. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS**

No current events.

## **VIII. CALL TO PUBLIC**

No member of the public wished to speak.

## **IX. ESTABLISHMENT OF FUTURE MEETING DATE**

The next regular meeting will be held on **Thursday**, November 19, 2015, beginning at 8:30 a.m. at 9535 E. Doubletree Ranch Road, Scottsdale, Arizona, 85258, in the Board Room.

## **X. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 10:10 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

  
Victoria Whitmore  
Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director